100 Years of Health Disparities

Is there the will to improve the health status of all?

Camara Phyllis Jones, MD, MPH, PhD

9th Annual James E. Clyburn Health Disparities Lecture
Arnold School of Public Health
University of South Carolina

Columbia, South Carolina
April 1, 2016
Levels of health intervention

Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Addressing the social determinants of health

Primary prevention

Safety net programs and secondary prevention

Medical care and tertiary prevention
But how do disparities arise?

- Differences in the quality of care received within the health care system

- Differences in access to health care, including preventive and curative services

- Differences in life opportunities, exposures, and stresses that result in differences in underlying health status


Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Differences in access to care

Differences in exposures and opportunities

Differences in quality of care
(ambulance slow or goes the wrong way)

Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
Addressing the social determinants of equity:

Why are there differences in resources along the cliff face?

Why are there differences in who is found at different parts of the cliff?

Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
3 dimensions of health intervention
3 dimensions of health intervention

Health services

Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
3 dimensions of health intervention

*Health services*

*Addressing social determinants of health*

Jones CP et al. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2009.
3 dimensions of health intervention

Health services

Addressing social determinants of health

Addressing social determinants of equity

What is racism?

A system

What is racism?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value

What is racism?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value based on the social interpretation of how one looks (which is what we call “race”)

What is racism?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value based on the social interpretation of how one looks (which is what we call “race”), that

- Unfairly disadvantages some individuals and communities
What is racism?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value based on the social interpretation of how one looks (which is what we call “race”), that

- Unfairly disadvantages some individuals and communities
- Unfairly advantages other individuals and communities

What is racism?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value based on the social interpretation of how one looks (which is what we call “race”), that

- Unfairly disadvantages some individuals and communities
- Unfairly advantages other individuals and communities
- Saps the strength of the whole society through the waste of human resources

Levels of Racism

- Institutionalized
- Personally-mediated
- Internalized

Institutionalized racism

- Differential access to the goods, services, and opportunities of society, by “race”

- Examples
  - Housing, education, employment, income
  - Medical facilities
  - Clean environment
  - Information, resources, voice

- Explains the association between social class and “race”

Personally-mediated racism

- Differential assumptions about the abilities, motives, and intents of others, by “race”
- Differential actions based on those assumptions

- Prejudice and discrimination

- Examples
  - Police brutality
  - Physician disrespect
  - Shopkeeper vigilance
  - Waiter indifference
  - Teacher devaluation

**Internalized racism**

- Acceptance by the stigmatized “races” of negative messages about our own abilities and intrinsic worth

- **Examples**
  - Self-devaluation
  - White man’s ice is colder
  - Resignation, helplessness, hopelessness

- Accepting limitations to our full humanity

Levels of Racism: A Gardener’s Tale

Who is the gardener?

- Power to decide
- Power to act
- Control of resources

- Dangerous when
  - Allied with one group
  - Not concerned with equity

“How is racism operating here?”

- **Identify mechanisms**
  - **Structures**: the *who?*, *what?*, *when?*, and *where?* of decision-making
  - **Policies**: the written *how?*
  - **Practices and norms**: the unwritten *how?*
  - **Values**: the *why?*
“How is racism operating here?”

- **Identify mechanisms**
  - **Structures:** the *who?, what?, when?, and where?* of decision-making
  - **Policies:** the written *how?*
  - **Practices and norms:** the unwritten *how?*
  - **Values:** the *why?*

“How is racism operating here?”

- **Identify mechanisms**
  - **Structures:** the *who?*, *what?*, *when?*, and *where?* of decision-making
  - **Policies:** the written *how?*
  - **Practices and norms:** the unwritten *how?*
  - **Values:** the *why?*

“How is racism operating here?”

- **Identify mechanisms**
  - **Structures**: the *who?*, *what?*, *when?*, and *where?* of decision-making
  - **Policies**: the written *how?*
  - **Practices and norms**: the unwritten *how?*
  - **Values**: the *why?*

“How is racism operating here?”

- **Identify mechanisms**
  - **Structures**: the *who?*, *what?*, *when?*, and *where?* of decision-making
  - **Policies**: the written *how?*
  - **Practices and norms**: the unwritten *how?*
  - **Values**: the *why?*

What is \textit{inequity}?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value based on \textit{[fill in the blank]}
What is inequity?

A system of structuring opportunity and assigning value based on [fill in the blank], that

- Unfairly disadvantages some individuals and communities
- Unfairly advantages other individuals and communities
- Saps the strength of the whole society through the waste of human resources
Many axes of inequity

- "Race"
- Gender
- Ethnicity
- Labor roles and social class markers
- Nationality, language, and legal status
- Sexual orientation
- Disability status
- Geography
- Religion
- Incarceration history

These are risk MARKERS
What is health equity?

- “Health equity” is assurance of the conditions for optimal health for all people

- Achieving health equity requires
  - Valuing all individuals and populations equally
  - Recognizing and rectifying historical injustices
  - Providing resources according to need

- Health disparities will be eliminated when health equity is achieved

Barriers to achieving health equity

- **A-historical culture**
  - The present as disconnected from the past
  - Current distribution of advantage/disadvantage as happenstance
  - Systems and structures as givens and immutable

- **Narrow focus on the individual**
  - Self-interest narrowly defined
  - Limited sense of interdependence
  - Limited sense of collective efficacy
  - Systems and structures as invisible or irrelevant

- **Myth of meritocracy**
  - Role of hard work
  - Denial of racism
  - Two babies: Equal potential or equal opportunity?
Strategies for achieving health equity

- To change opportunity structures
  - Understand the importance of history
  - Challenge the narrow focus on the individual
  - Expose the “myth of meritocracy”
  - Examine successful strategies from outside the US
Strategies for achieving health equity

- To change opportunity structures
  - Understand the importance of history
  - Challenge the narrow focus on the individual
  - Expose the “myth of meritocracy”
  - Examine successful strategies from outside the US
  - Acknowledge existence of systems and structures
  - View systems and structures as modifiable
Strategies for achieving health equity

- To change opportunity structures
  - Understand the importance of history
  - Challenge the narrow focus on the individual
  - Expose the “myth of meritocracy”
  - Examine successful strategies from outside the US
  - Acknowledge existence of systems and structures
  - View systems and structures as modifiable
  - Break down barriers to opportunity
  - Build bridges to opportunity
Strategies for achieving health equity

- To change opportunity structures
  - Understand the importance of history
  - Challenge the narrow focus on the individual
  - Expose the “myth of meritocracy”
  - Examine successful strategies from outside the US
  - Acknowledge existence of systems and structures
  - View systems and structures as modifiable
  - Break down barriers to opportunity
  - Build bridges to opportunity
  - Transform consumers to citizens
  - Intervene on decision-making processes
Strategies for achieving health equity

- **To change opportunity structures**
  - Understand the importance of history
  - Challenge the narrow focus on the individual
  - Expose the “myth of meritocracy”
  - Examine successful strategies from outside the US
  - Acknowledge existence of systems and structures
  - View systems and structures as modifiable
  - Break down barriers to opportunity
  - Build bridges to opportunity
  - Transform consumers to citizens
  - Intervene on decision-making processes

- **To value all people equally**
  - Break out of bubbles to experience our common humanity
  - Embrace ALL children as OUR children
ICERD

- *International Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination*
  - International anti-racism treaty adopted by the UN General Assembly in 1965
  - [http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CERD.aspx](http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CERD.aspx)

- US signed in 1966
- US ratified in 1994
Current status

- 3rd US report submitted to the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) in 2013

- 82 parallel reports submitted by civil society organizations

- CERD considered at its 85th session (13-14 Aug 2014)
CERD Concluding Observations

- 14-page document (25 Sep 2014) available online

- Concerns and recommendations
  - Racial profiling (paras 8 and 18)
  - Residential segregation (para 13)
  - Achievement gap in education (para 14)
  - Differential access to health care (para 15)
  - Disproportionate incarceration (para 20)
CERD Concluding Observations

- 14-page document (25 Sep 2014) available online

- Concerns and recommendations
  - “The Committee recommends that the State party adopt a national action plan to combat structural racial discrimination” (para 25)
  
  - “The Committee recommends that the State party increase its efforts to raise public awareness and knowledge of the Convention throughout its territory” (para 32)
Japanese Lanterns: Colored perceptions
The colors we think we see are due to the lights by which we look. These colored lights distort and mask our true variability.
What is “race”? 

A social classification, not a biological descriptor. The social interpretation of how one looks in a “race”-conscious society.
Dual Reality: A restaurant saga
I looked up and noticed a sign . . .
Racism structures “Open/Closed” signs in our society.
Those on the outside are very aware of the two-sided nature of the sign.

It is difficult to recognize systems of inequity that privilege us.
Is there really a two-sided sign?

Hard to know, when only see “Open”. A privilege not to HAVE to know. Once DO know, can choose to act.
Life on a Conveyor Belt: Moving to action
Racism is most often passive
1. Name racism
2. Ask “How is racism operating here?”
3. Organize and strategize to act
Japanese Lanterns: Colored perceptions
Dual Reality: A restaurant saga
Life on a Conveyor Belt: Moving to action
Camara Phyllis Jones, MD, MPH, PhD
President
American Public Health Association

Senior Fellow
Satcher Health Leadership Institute and
Cardiovascular Research Institute
Morehouse School of Medicine

cpjones@msm.edu
(404) 756-5216
(404) 374-3198 mobile
Anti-Racism Collaborative

- **Communication and Dissemination**
  - APHA Webinar Series on Racism and Health
  - Regional Town Halls on Anti-Racism and Health

- **Education and Development**
  - Curriculum for schools of public health and medicine
  - APHA Fellowship on Anti-Racism and Health

- **Global Matters**
  - International Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination
  - US-Brazil Joint Action Plan to Eliminate Racism
Anti-Racism Collaborative

- **Liaison and Partnership**
  - Catalog and connect local anti-racism efforts
  - Outreach to partner organizations

- **Organizational Excellence**
  - “How is racism operating here?”
  - National Advisory Committee on Anti-Racism and Health

- **Policy and Legislation**
  - Catalog anti-racism policies across jurisdictions
  - Propose new areas for legislation

- **Science and Publications**
  - Develop compendium of measures of racism
  - Link anti-racism researchers
Camara Phyllis Jones, MD, MPH, PhD
President
American Public Health Association

Senior Fellow
Satcher Health Leadership Institute and
Cardiovascular Research Institute
Morehouse School of Medicine

cpjones@msm.edu
(404) 756-5216
(404) 374-3198 mobile